

The 4th Hyogo Prefecture Senior High School English Debate Contest
- The Final Match -
January 30, 2011
At Himeji Nishi Senior High School

Proposition: High school students should be allowed to work part-time.

Affirmative Constructive Speech (4min.)

Hyogo Prefectural Amagasaki Oda Senior High School

Thank you, chairperson. We strongly believe that high school students should be allowed to work part-time. We have three reasons for this.

The first reason is money. We can earn money by doing part-time jobs. This money will help the household economy. High school students create a burden on the household economy. For example, our parents have to pay for our hobbies, our clothes, our cell-phone fees, etc. If we could do part-time jobs, we would pay for many of these things by ourselves. Then the burden would be decreased. According to a survey done by Benesse in 2008, 96% of high school students have mobile phones. 89% of students who don't work part-time have their phone fees paid by their parents. This is clearly a burden on the household economy. On the other hand, 44% of students who work part-time pay their phone fees themselves. So, doing part-time jobs will benefit our households.

The second reason is social manners. Students can learn social manners, such as greetings, polite language, and time keeping through part-time jobs. According to a research by the Japan Institute for Labor Policy and Training in 2006, 65.9% of the high school students who work part-time jobs answered that they can learn social manners through their jobs. Social manners might be able to be learned in school life. But through part-time jobs, we can participate in real society. For example, in doing part-time jobs, we must not be late for our jobs, because we may be fired if we have such an attitude. But, in school life, if we are late for school, we cannot be forced to quit school. Like this, we can learn social manners through part-time jobs more effectively and more strictly than through school life. So, part-time jobs are a better way to learn social manners than school life.

The third reason is good use of time. Now, many high school students waste their free time. According to a survey done on 8000 people by "Benesse Corporation" in 2008, the average length of high school students' free time is 7 hours per day. Only 55% of students say they study in their free time, and they only study for 34 minutes a day on average. On the other hand, 92% say they use their mobile phones, and they spend 72 minutes on it. They watch TV or DVDs for an average of

95 minutes a day. 76% say they have nothing special to do in most of their free time. This is a lot of wasted time. If high school students are allowed to work part-time, it will surely expand the possibility for them to make good use of time.

For these three important reasons, we strongly believe that high school students should be allowed to work part-time. Thank you.

Negative Cross-Examination (3min.)

NEG: On your second point, how many students who work part-time got fired just because of being late for work?

AFF: I don't know, but many students ...

NEG: Thank you.

NEG: On your second point, you said that students are tardy? You said that students become late for school or work, am I right?

AFF: Right.

NEG: So, you mean that if they are tardy they are not even capable of their own schedules. That means they are not allowed to work, right?

AFF: ...

NEG: OK. Thank you. (laughter)

NEG: On your second point, isn't it too late to start working when they become university students?

AFF: Yes, because many high school students start working after graduation from high schools.

NEG: Do you have any evidence to show that?

AFF: Yes. According to the research by the Ministry of Health, Labor, and Welfare in 2009, the number of the high school students ...

NEG: OK. Thank you.

NEG: On your first point, do you have any data to show how many people work part-time in order to help out their family budget?

AFF: I don't know, but...

NEG: Thank you very much.

NEG: On your third point, what is the relevance between part-time job and using time wisely?

AFF: What is "relevance"?

NEG: "Kankeisei (関係性)." What is the "Kankeisei" between part-time job and using, using time more wisely? (laughter)

AFF: What does "wisely" mean?

NEG: Oh, you mentioned in your constructive speech. OK, thank you.

NEG: On your third point, you said that 76% of the people have nothing to do in particular. Doesn't that mean that they can use that time to study?

AFF: I said...um...

NEG: They can, right?

AFF: They answered they have nothing particular...

NEG: So, if they try, they can use that time for study. Am I correct? OK, thank you.

NEG: On your second point, what about club activities? Can't they teach social skills?

AFF: Yes, but we can learn it more effectively in part-time jobs.

NEG: In social skills, is responsibility included?

AFF: No.

NEG: OK. Thank you.

Negative Constructive Speech (4min.)

Kobe Municipal Fukiai Senior High School

Thank you Ms. Chairperson. We on the negative side strongly believe that high school students should not be allowed to work part-time for three reasons.

Our first point is overstress. Nowadays, overstress is one of the biggest problems for Japanese. Not only adults but even high school students have trouble dealing with stress. NTT Navi-net Space asked for the reasons why they felt stress in their daily life. 65% of students said that they felt stress from school exams and tests. According to a different survey, Nikkei BP net, 34% of the people surveyed said that they felt stress every day at work, and 42% felt work stress sometimes. It is natural to believe that adding part-time jobs onto the schedule of a high school student would increase stress levels. According to a different survey done by "Ann", 24% of students said that they quit their jobs because of bad relationships with coworkers, and 16% said that the jobs were too hard. From this data, we can clearly see that trying to study and work at the same time is a huge burden and too much stress for young teenagers.

Our second point is unemployment. According to a research study, there are 2,400,000 people who are unemployed and would like to work part-time but cannot. In general, the ratio of openings to job applications for part time jobs has reached the lowest number ever. This is because of the economic depression. However, according to INTELLIGENCE, part-time job recruitment is increasing only for high school students. In addition, they argue that the reason for the increase in recruitment of high school students is because the wages of adults are increasing so companies tend to hire more high school students because they are cheaper. According to the same source, adults earn 994 yen per hour in comparison to high school students who earn only 815 yen per hour. As a result of the different wages, during difficult economic times, companies generally hire employees whose wages are cheaper. Because of this, jobs have been taken from adults, who have family responsibilities. Furthermore, about 627 billion yen of the general account budget from the government of Japan has been spent on the unemployed. It would be more beneficial for Japanese society to decrease the unemployment rate.

Our third point is a lack of study time. If high school students work part-time, their study time will decrease. According to a research study, 21% of students who don't work part-time study for more than 2 hours compared to only 5% of students who work part-time. From this data, we can say that students who work part-time do not study as much as non-working students. In addition, among students whose deviation value is more than 60, 47% of them study more than 2 hours a day. In comparison, among students whose deviation value is less than 40, only 9% of them study more than 2 hours a day. From this data, we can see that students who use a lot of time on studies have higher scholastic results. It is obvious that the more time those students study, the better their grades and scholastic results will be. Therefore we can say that the scholastic abilities of high school students who work part-time will be lower than the students who don't because they lack study time.

We have talked about overstress, unemployment, and a lack of study time. For these reasons, we strongly oppose the proposition. Thank you very much.

Affirmative Cross-Examination (3min.)

AFF: In the first point, can they choose their jobs?

NEG: Can you repeat it again?

AFF: Can they choose their part-time job?

NEG: So, what do you mean?

AFF: Yes or No?

NEG: Yes.

AFF: Thank you very much. Did you say working part-time makes stress? In your first point.

NEG: Yes.

AFF: In the INTELLIGENCE data, how many people answered these questions?

NEG: Umm...

AFF: Thank you. On your first point, did you say that exams and tests give stress?

NEG: Yes. Because more than half of people...

AFF: Then, do you think a correspondence course also give stress?

NEG: Correspondence means high level ...

AFF: Tsushinkyuiku(通信教育).

NEG: Yes, because they have tests and exams...it's really...

AFF: Thank you. On your third point, can the high school students who belong to any clubs study after their club activities?

NEG: Yes. Many high school students do club activities, and they still have good grades...

AFF: On your second point, how many people answered the INTELLIGENCE data?

NEG: It has 240 high school students.

AFF: On your third point, do you know the average frequency of club activities and part-time jobs per week?

NEG: Yes.

AFF: Then, do you know how many students who join clubs don't want to study?

NEG: No, but many students...

AFF: Thank you. On your first point, why is it bad for high school students to feel stress?

NEG: Stress is a bad thing. It's natural, it's common sense that stress is a bad thing.

AFF: On your second point, do all the shops and companies hire high school students because they are cheaper than adults?

NEG: Yes, because they don't have much experience as adults.

Negative Rebuttal Speech (3min.)

On their second point, when we asked if social skills included responsibility, they said no. However, according to my dictionary, social skills includes responsibility and from the data from Asahi Newspaper, that, uh no, I'm sorry, it's not Asahi Newspaper..um..according to Ann asked 400...540 parents that if students learn necessary responsibility at school, 89% of the parents thought that students learn necessary responsibility, so their point does not stand.

On their second point, when we asked if students who are tardy are responsible of having part-time jobs, they could not answer, and from common sense, we can say that people who are tardy are not responsible and are not capable of having part-time jobs. Therefore, their point does not stand.

And on their second point, when we asked club activities are one of the places to learn social skills and we have data here and according to the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science, and Technology, 50% of high school students could build up good relation, good friendship. And 28% said they could be responsible, and gain how to control their emotions through club activities, so that means they can learn social skills through club activities. Therefore, their second point does not stand.

On their second point, when I asked how many students who work part time got fired just because of being late to work, they said they have no data, so their second point failed.

On their third point, they said that 76% of students say that they have nothing to do on certain time, but they could not answer if we, when we asked, if they would use that time for study, they could not answer, so that means the students could use their time for study if they wanted to. Therefore, their third point does not stand.

On their first point, when we asked how many high school students work part-time, who work

part-time to help family budget, and they said no. And, we asked if they have data and they said no and we have data here. According to Mobile research, 78.4% of students who work part-time in order to have they want, in order to have what they want, however, only 6% of 15.8% of students work part-time to help their family budget. Therefore, working part-time does not help family budget so much, so their point was weak.

On their third point, when we asked the relevance between part-time jobs and their use of time, they could not answer or did not understand our question. Either way, they did not answer appropriately. Therefore, their third point does not stand.

Affirmative Rebuttal Speech (3min.)

In their first point, if students feel stress from part-time jobs, they should change their part-time jobs. Moreover, there is a possibility that they are bullied in their club activities by other members. This is a lot of stress for the students, so their first point is weak. Moreover, they don't know how many people answered the INTELLIGENCE data, so the first point is weak.

On their first point, I asked why it is bad for high school students to have stress, and they said stress is a bad thing. But, we can't help feeling stress after growing up, so it is good to experience for high school students to put up with stress for their future.

On their first point, when I asked if exams and tests give stress we can learn in the correspondence course, they answered, but I didn't understand their answer because their speech and English was too difficult to follow, so we couldn't understand their answer. So, their first point is questionable. (laughter)

In their second point, in their first INTELLIGENCE data only very few people answered, so their second data or evidence is weak. Their second reason is weak. And in their third point, they said that they know the average frequency of part-time jobs and club activities, but they didn't show us any. But we know the average frequency of club activity per week and part-time jobs. Only 0.39% said they work every day. On the other hand, 76% of the students who join clubs do club activities 6 or 7 days per week. Moreover, we have the data of how many students who join clubs don't want to study. 63% of the students who join clubs don't want to study, so their third point is weak.

On their third point, I asked, "Can the high school students who belong to any clubs study after their club activities?", and they said yes. So, it is possible for high school students who work part-time to study after their part-time jobs. 92.0% of high school students think that study is the most important even if they work part-time, so their third point is weak.

Negative Summary Speech (3min.)

Thank you Ms. Chairperson. First of all, we would like to summarize today's debate, starting off by pointing out how we attacked the affirmative side and how their points do not stand.

On their first point they, when we asked how many students have worked part-time to help out the family budget, they had no data to prove this. And we have data that Bennese says that students use their money on snacks, comic books, and fashion. So if they gain money, they were sure to use their money on that, so their point does not stand.

On their second point, they said that in the social skills responsibility is not included, but we have shown that their school, 89% of parents think that school can teach responsibility. Therefore, their point does not stand. And also, when we asked if people who are tardy are responsible enough to do part-time jobs, they could not answer. But we can tell from common sense that they are not, so their certain point does not stand, either.

On their third point, they said that 76% of students have nothing to do on certain amounts of time, and, but, when we asked if they could use that for study, they could not answer. So, that means they could use their time on study, which means that their third point does not stand at all.

Next, I would like to show how the affirmative side attacked us and how we defended our point to show how our points were beneficial for the society. On our first point they have attacked us by saying that ... they have shown their personal opinion, but as we mentioned in our constructive speech that high school students had trouble dealing with stress. So there they failed to attack this point. And also on our first point, they said that exams and tests give stress and we have clearly shown that by adding part-time job it will increase the amount of stress. So our point still stands.

On our second point they didn't fully attack this point. We have shown we should not forget those 2,400,000 people who need part-time jobs, and 2,400,000 people whose jobs were taken away because of part-time job is taken away from high school students so we shouldn't forget those people. So our point is important.

On our third point they have attacked us by saying that club activities can do so. And they showed data that 63% don't want to study. However, it is common sense that students who don't want to study doesn't mean that they don't study. Through this debate, therefore, our point still stands.

Through this debate we were able to learn many ideas and thoughts from both sides, but as a result the negative team has successfully proven that our points were more beneficial for the society and for our future. Thank you very much.

Affirmative Summary Speech (3min.)

Thank you, chairperson. Thank you, audience. I'm sorry, but it was very difficult for us to understand their English. (laughter) But, let me summarize today's debate.

The title of their first speech is was overstress. In our rebuttal, to this point we claimed if students feel stress from working part-time jobs they should change their part-time jobs. Moreover, there is a possibility of bullying by other members. So their first point is weak.

The second point was unemployment. In our rebuttal, to this point we claimed their first INTELLIGENCE data has few people to answer, so their second point is not reliable.

The third was lack of study time. In our rebuttal, to this point we claimed club activities are more frequently done than working part-time jobs. Moreover, 65% of the students who join clubs say that they don't want to study as we mentioned. So their third point is weak.

Our first point was money. In our first point, we showed that the money earned by part-time jobs helps the household economy by reducing the financial burden on parents. And with a lot of money high school students can attend cram schools and pay for college entrance exams by themselves. So our first point is strong.

Our second point was social manners. In this point, we argued that high school students can learn social manners at the workplaces more surly than at high schools. Their rebuttal to this point was that responsibility is necessary for high school students. But we didn't talk about responsibility. What we mean is that social skills which include a lot of something good for high school students should be learned by the part-time jobs, so our second point is strong.

And our third point was good use of time. We clearly showed that many high school students waste their free time. We couldn't listen to their rebuttal, but we claimed high school students should use time effectively like working part-time jobs. So our third point is strong, we believe.

Therefore, we can say that high school students should be allowed to work part-time. Thank you. That's all.